## SPECIAL ISSUE Striving for Social Justice and Equity in Higher Education

# education policy analysis archives

A peer-reviewed, independent, open access, multilingual journal



Arizona State University

Volume 28 Number 37

March 29, 2021

ISSN 1068-2341

## Introduction: Striving for Social Justice and Equity in Higher Education

Irina S. Okhremtchouk San Francisco State University

*Caroline Turner* California State University, Sacramento

Ċ

Patrick Newell California State University, Chico United States

**Citation**: Okhremtchouk, I. S., Turner, C. S. V., & Newell, P. A. (2021). Introduction: Striving for social justice and equity in higher education. *Education Policy Analysis Archives, 29*(37). <u>https://doi.org/10.14507/epaa.29.5154</u> This article is part of the special issue, *Striving for Social Justice and Equity in Higher Education,* guest edited by Irina Okhremtchuk, Caroline Turner, & Patrick Newell.

**Abstract:** Through the introduction of our special issue, Striving for Social Justice and Equity in Higher Education, we aim to add to a continued and much-needed discussion on deeply seated institutional inequities that remain to shape the ways by which education occurs across the higher

Journal website: <u>http://epaa.asu.edu/ojs/</u> Facebook: /EPAAA Twitter: @epaa\_aape Manuscript received: 2/25/2021 Revisions received: 1/3/2021 Accepted: 2/3/2021 education landscape. As we present manuscripts included in this issue, our goal is to capture the vast and many layers within higher education encompassing research and discussions on policy and systems that impact administration, leadership, faculty, and student experiences. In our concluding remarks, we stress that even though deeply seated institutional inequities remain, the work of this type must continue as it is part of a broader fight waged for social and racial justice. It is our hope that institutional leaders and policymakers will use the wealth of knowledge shared in this special issue to cultivate nurturing learning environments that include and value the talent and perspectives of those who have been systematically undervalued and marginalized. **Key words:** Higher Education; Education Policy; Social Justice

## Introducción: En busca de la justicia social y la equidad en la educación superior

**Resumen:** A través de la introducción de este número especial, En busca de la justicia social y la equidad en la educación superior, agregamos y continuamos la discusión tan necesaria sobre las inequidades institucionales profundamente arraigadas que siguen dando forma a las formas en que la educación ocurre en el panorama de la educación superior. Nuestro objetivo es captar las vastas y muchas capas dentro de la educación superior que abarcan la investigación y las discusiones sobre políticas y sistemas que impactan la administración, el liderazgo, la facultad y las experiencias de los estudiantes. En nuestra conclusión, enfatizamos que aunque persisten inequidades institucionales profundamente arraigadas, el trabajo de este tipo debe continuar, ya que es parte de una lucha más amplia por la justicia social y racial. Esperamos que los líderes institucionales y los formuladores de políticas utilicen la riqueza del conocimiento compartido en este número especial para cultivar entornos de aprendizaje enriquecedores que incluyan y valoren el talento y las perspectivas de aquellos que han sido sistemáticamente infravalorados y marginados. **Palabras clave:** Educación superior; Política educativa; Justicia social

### Introdução: Buscando justiça social e equidade no ensino superior

**Resumo:** Com a introdução desta edição especial, Buscando Justiça Social e Equidade no Ensino Superior, acrescentamos e continuamos a discussão muito necessária sobre as desigualdades institucionais profundamente arraigadas que permanecem para moldar as formas pelas quais a educação ocorre no cenário do ensino superior. Nosso objetivo é capturar as vastas e muitas camadas dentro do ensino superior, abrangendo pesquisas e discussões sobre políticas e sistemas que impactam a administração, liderança, professores e experiências dos alunos. Em nossa conclusão, destacamos que, embora permaneçam iniquidades institucionais profundamente arraigadas, o trabalho desse tipo deve continuar, pois faz parte de uma luta mais ampla pela justiça social e racial. Esperamos que os líderes institucionais e formuladores de políticas usem a riqueza do conhecimento compartilhado nesta edição especial para cultivar ambientes de aprendizagem estimulantes que incluam e valorizem o talento e as perspectivas daqueles que têm sido sistematicamente subestimados e marginalizados.

Palavras-chave: Ensino Superior; Política educacional; Justica social

## Introduction

For this special issue, we purposefully solicited manuscripts that embrace topics focusing on social justice within the higher education context and its many layers while simultaneously addressing factors that encompass policy and systems that directly impact administration, leadership, faculty and student experiences. When we initially envisioned this special issue, the national conversation on racial injustice and racism had not reached the boiling point it had in the final year of the 45th Presidency. During this time, discussions of ethnicity, social justice, and the impact of structural racism became the leading and constant stories featured by news and other media and further stoked by its foregrounding in U.S. election strategy and coverage. Conversely, the conversation and work in academic circles had already begun to evolve to focus on structural racism within educational organizations and systems (McGee, 2020; Merolla & Jackson, 2019). These discussions focus on the framing of education and scrutinize whose frames of reference for education and excellence mattered in the framing, directly exposing institutional injustices often experienced by people of color and underrepresented populations (Burke, 2020; Crowley & Smith, 2020; Solórzano & Pérez-Huber, 2020). Likewise, and as the nation began openly discussing issues of structural bias, scholars were exposing deeply seated institutional inequities that continue to shape the ways by which education occurs across the higher education landscape. The manuscripts and discussions detailed in this special issue are informed by the aforementioned history and empirical research.

We open this special issue with an article discussing racial and ethnic diversity in higher education and its impact on policy, "Racial and Ethnic Diversity in Higher Education: White Privileged Resistance and Implications for Leadership." This timely piece serves as an entryway to other manuscripts included in the issue. In their article, Lidyvez Sawyer and Roberta Waite center the audience's attention on the pervasive white privileged resistance impacting the leadership structures within higher education and propose steps to initiate the dismantling process of deeply rooted structures of racism. The scholars unpack the history at the root of mitigating the current underpinnings of racial and ethnic inequities from their fundamental origin, which they term as a mere starting point in establishing sustainable change. Sawyer and Waite challenge their audience to examine, identify and begin to undo colonized structures of America's higher education systems, acknowledge the implications of the history of structural racism and its impact on leadership, policies, and the academy's sloth-like progression towards "diversity." As part of their questioning, the scholars call on higher education leadership to be intentional in unweaving the progeny of structural racism: fragility and privilege.

The second section of the issue focuses on college presidents. Jon McNaughtan and Bryan K. Hotchkins draw our collective attention to the experiences of presidents of color within higher education. Their study, "Leading at the Crossroads: Understanding How Identity Influences Presidential Communication for Black Community College Presidents," opens a window to six Black community college presidents' experiences and how their racial identities guided their communication practices. The authors found that presidents of color view their communication through a social justice lens while these leaders also recognize their responsibility to the institution they serve. The authors explore the following five themes which emerged in their conversation with these presidents: a consciousness of who is listening, a sense of racial battle fatigue, a focus on local impact, connection and support from the community, and the skill of racial and social adaptation. The scholars conclude by stressing that the integration of race and leadership is critical to for all higher education leaders who desire to do the work needed to advance causes of social justice and equity.

As we pivot from experiences of Black community college presidents, in the next article Tenisha Tevis explores the role of university presidency. Rooted in a larger study on whether White male presidents in higher education can respond to racism, in "'It's a Sea-change': Understanding the Role the Racial and Socio-political Climate Play on the Role-shift of the American College Presidency", Tevis challenges readers to advance their understanding of the American college presidency and how the current racial and socio-political climate has shaped college presidential leadership. This timely work posits that just as higher education has been due for a change in direction, so has the postsecondary presidency.

In the next section we intend to highlight the experiences and the pathways to becoming LatinX faculty. Caroline Turner meticulously unpacks her own personal and professional background relative to the topic in her contribution, "On Diversity, Identity and Socialization: Inequality of Educational Outcomes." Situating her own experience within a national context based on U.S. census and *Chronicle of Higher Education* data and detailing narratives collected via interviews and relevant extant literature, Turner portrays the myriad issues involved in the underrepresentation of Latinx women as students, and later, professors in higher education. Furthermore, she draws our attention toward understanding how role identity and identifiers are used to categorize LatinX women through an examination and discussion of the LatinX designation and privilege. Turner concludes with a list of recommendations on how the underrepresentation of LatinX women and other marginalized groups can be addressed.

This special issue would not be complete without empirical work highlighting student experiences within higher education institutions' walls, which comprises the next section. In their study, "Examining the Continuum of Black Student Leadership: From Community to College and Beyond," Bryan K. Hotchkins and Jon McNaughtan examine the leadership involvement of 11 Black collegians about how they make sense of enacting transgenerationally informed knowledge/s as racial socialization to navigate a predominantly White campus. Through careful analysis, the authors report that the participants' parents and elders racially socialized them to be self-sacrificing leaders by using values, respect, and honor to preserve Black culture, people, and traditions. Likewise, these racial socialization processes influenced these Black collegians to become leaders who built and sustained Black college communities by being resilient. The authors also highlight the added value in practicing racial resistance, which exposes racially threatening opposition and identifying acts of racism menacing in higher education circles.

International students have long been termed the "bread and butter" of U.S. higher education because of the additional revenue their tuition brings the institution. Notably, international students' presence has expanded significantly over the last two decades across American colleges and universities, and this expansion, in its own right, presents equity issues. In "More than Learning English? The Impact of University Intensive English Language Program Attendance on International Student Academic Achievement," Adam Clark, Dianna Lippincott, and Jeongeun Kim examine the disparities in academic achievement between two distinctive groups of international students. The authors explored how some international students, in particular, can be found within marginalized groups. By examining international students' experiences and institutional policies with respect to student admissions/placements, this work is one of few that aims to frame Intensive English Language Programs as potential vehicles for social justice among marginalized international student populations. The authors also call on policymakers to focus on data equity and transparency in tracking these outcomes at higher education institutions.

We conclude this special issue with an article highlighting partners of higher educational institutions: community and family stakeholders. In their contribution, "School, University, and Community Collaboration to Promote Equity through Inclusive Cultural Competence," Tammy

Ellis-Robinson and Jessica Wayde Coles explore collaborative engagements among stakeholders to identify effective practices and ongoing needs to develop inclusive cultural competence in higher education training programs for pre-service and in-service teachers. The authors highlight the importance of ongoing collaborative engagements between the higher education institutions that are responsible for preparing competent and well-rounded professionals and the local communities that these higher education entities aim to serve.

As we continue to tackle and highlight challenges within higher education contexts, it is important not to lose sight of the fact that, even though deeply seated institutional inequities remain, this work must continue as it is part of a broader fight waged for social and racial justice. The effects of unwelcoming and often toxic work environments (Harper & Hurtado, 2007; Turner, 1994; Zambrana, 2018) highlight the critical importance of institutional change and responsiveness for the persistence and development of those who continue to be minoritized in higher education. Institutional leaders and policy makers can use the wealth of knowledge shared in this special issue to cultivate nurturing learning environments that include and value the talent and perspectives of those who have been systematically undervalued and marginalized.

## References

- Burke, M. G. (2020) Moving beyond statements: The need for action to address structural racism at predominantly white institutions. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Perspectives in Higher Education*, 5(1), 174-179. https://doi.org/10.32674/jimphe.v5i1.2632
- Crowley, R. M., & Smith, W. L. (2020). A divergence of interests: Critical race theory and white privilege pedagogy. *Teachers College Record*, 122(1), 1-24.
- Harper, S. R., & Hurtado, S. (2007). Nine themes in campus racial climates and implications for institutional transformation. New Directions for Student Services, (120), 7–24. https://doi.org/10.1002/ss.254
- McGee, E. O. (2020). Interrogating structural racism in STEM higher education. *Educational Researcher*, 49(9), 633-644. https://doi.org/10.3102/0013189X20972718
- Merolla, D. M., & Jackson, O. (2019). Structural racism as the fundamental cause of the academic achievement gap. *Sociology Compass*, 13(6), e12696. https://doi.org/10.1111/soc4.12696
- Solórzano, D. G., & Pérez Huber, L. (2020). Racial microaggressions: Using critical race theory to respond to everyday racism. Teacher's College Press. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003005995-9
- Turner, C. S. (1994). A guest in someone else's house: Students of color on campus. *The Review of Higher Education*, *17*(4), 355–370. https://doi.org/10.1353/rhe.1994.0008
- Zambrana, R. E. (2018). Toxic ivory towers: The consequences of work stress of underrepresented minority faculty. Rutgers University Press. https://doi.org/10.36019/9780813593012

## About the Guest Editors

## Irina S. Okhremtchouk

## San Francisco State University irinao@sfsu.edu

Irina S. Okhremtchouk is an associate professor of educational administration in the Department of Equity, Leadership Studies, and Instructional Technologies at San Francisco State University's Graduate College of Education. She also coordinates SFSU's educational administration certification and educational administration MA programs. In her capacity as educational administration program coordinator, Okhremtchouk is charged with preparing well-rounded and well-informed social justice leaders and school administrators who are ready to build and maintain inclusive school communities, as well as work persistently to eliminate racism, inequalities, and injustices. Okhremtchouk's expertise is in the area of school organization, policy, and school finance. Specifically, her scholarly work stems from a deep interest in how to translate research into better-informed public policy yielding a long-lasting impact on educational leadership, policy, and administration. Irina received her Ph.D. in School Organization and Educational Policy from the U.C. Davis School of Education.

## **Caroline Sotello Viernes Turner**

California State University, Sacramento csturner@csus.edu

An internationally recognized and award-winning scholar, Caroline Sotello Viernes Turner is professor emerita of educational leadership at California State University, Sacramento, and Lincoln Professor Emerita of Higher Education and Ethics at Arizona State University. She served as president of the Association for the Study of Higher Education (ASHE) and as interim dean for the College of Education at California State University, Sacramento. She is the author of Women of Color in Academe: Living with Multiple Marginality and coauthor with Samuel L. Myers Jr. of Faculty of Color in Academe: Bittersweet Success. Her numerous recognitions include the University of California, Davis (UCD) School of Education Distinguished Alumna Award and the American Educational Research Association (AERA) Scholars of Color in Education Career Contribution Award. She received her Ph.D. in Administration and Policy Analysis from the Stanford University School of Education.

## Patrick Newell

California State University, Chico

## pnewell@csuchico.edu

Patrick Newell serves as Dean of Meriam Library at California State University, Chico. His research efforts focus on policy implications for access to educational and informational resources and how education policy translates into institutional change. He received his Ph.D. in School Organization and Educational Policy from the U.C. Davis School of Education and his MLIS from the UCLA Graduate School of Education and Information Studies.

## SPECIAL ISSUE Striving for Social Justice and Equity in Higher Education

# education policy analysis archives

Volume 29 Number 37

March 29, 2021

ISSN 1068-2341



Readers are free to copy, display, distribute, and adapt this article, as long as the work is attributed to the author(s) and **Education Policy Analysis Archives**, the changes are identified, and the same license applies to the derivative work. More details of this Creative Commons license are available at <u>https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/</u>. **EPAA** is published by the Mary Lou Fulton Institute and Graduate School of Education at Arizona State University Articles are indexed in CIRC (Clasificación Integrada de Revistas Científicas, Spain), DIALNET (Spain), <u>Directory of Open Access Journals</u>, EBSCO Education Research Complete, ERIC, Education Full Text (H.W. Wilson), QUALIS A1 (Brazil), SCImago Journal Rank, SCOPUS, SOCOLAR (China).

Please send errata notes to Audrey Amrein-Beardsley at audrey.beardsley@asu.edu

Join EPAA's Facebook community at <u>https://www.facebook.com/EPAAAAPE</u> and Twitter feed @epaa\_aape.

## education policy analysis archives editorial board

Lead Editor: Audrey Amrein-Beardsley (Arizona State University) Editor Consultor: Gustavo E. Fischman (Arizona State University) Associate Editors: Melanie Bertrand, David Carlson, Lauren Harris, Danah Henriksen, Eugene Judson, Mirka Koro-Ljungberg, Daniel Liou, Scott Marley, Keon McGuire, Molly Ott, Iveta Silova (Arizona State University)

Madelaine Adelman Arizona State University Cristina Alfaro San Diego State University Gary Anderson New York University

#### Michael W. Apple

University of Wisconsin, Madison Jeff Bale University of Toronto, Canada Aaron Benavot SUNY Albany

David C. Berliner Arizona State University Henry Braun Boston College **Casey Cobb** University of Connecticut Arnold Danzig San Jose State University Linda Darling-Hammond Stanford University Elizabeth H. DeBray University of Georgia David E. DeMatthews University of Texas at Austin Chad d'Entremont Rennie Center for Education Research & Policy John Diamond University of Wisconsin, Madison Matthew Di Carlo Albert Shanker Institute Sherman Dorn Arizona State University Michael J. Dumas University of California, Berkeley Kathy Escamilla University of Colorado, Boulder Yariv Feniger Ben-Gurion University of the Negev Melissa Lynn Freeman Adams State College Rachael Gabriel University of Connecticut

Amy Garrett Dikkers University of North Carolina, Wilmington Gene V Glass Arizona State University Ronald Glass University of California, Santa Cruz

Jacob P. K. Gross University of Louisville Eric M. Haas WestEd

Julian Vasquez Heilig California State University, Sacramento Kimberly Kappler Hewitt University of North Carolina Greensboro Aimee Howley Ohio University

Steve Klees University of Maryland Jaekyung Lee SUNY Buffalo Jessica Nina Lester Indiana University Amanda E. Lewis University of Illinois, Chicago Chad R. Lochmiller Indiana University Christopher Lubienski Indiana University Sarah Lubienski Indiana University

William J. Mathis University of Colorado, Boulder Michele S. Moses University of Colorado, Boulder Julianne Moss Deakin University, Australia Sharon Nichols University of Texas, San Antonio Eric Parsons University of Missouri-Columbia Amanda U. Potterton University of Kentucky Susan L. Robertson Bristol University Gloria M. Rodriguez University of California, Davis R. Anthony Rolle University of Houston A. G. Rud Washington State University

Patricia Sánchez University of University of Texas, San Antonio Janelle Scott University of California, Berkeley Jack Schneider University of Massachusetts Lowell Noah Sobe Loyola University

## Nelly P. Stromquist

University of Maryland **Benjamin Superfine** University of Illinois, Chicago Adai Tefera Virginia Commonwealth University A. Chris Torres Michigan State University Tina Trujillo University of California, Berkeley Federico R. Waitoller University of Illinois, Chicago Larisa Warhol University of Connecticut John Weathers University of Colorado, Colorado Springs Kevin Welner University of Colorado, Boulder Terrence G. Wiley Center for Applied Linguistics John Willinsky Stanford University Jennifer R. Wolgemuth University of South Florida Kyo Yamashiro Claremont Graduate University Miri Yemini Tel Aviv University, Israel

Introduction: Striving for Social Justice and Equity in Higher Education

## arquivos analíticos de políticas educativas conselho editorial

Editor Consultor: Gustavo E. Fischman (Arizona State University)

Editoras Coordenadores: **Marcia Pletsch, Sandra Regina Sales** (Universidade Federal Rural do Rio de Janeiro) Editores Associadas: **Andréa Barbosa Gouveia** (Universidade Federal do Paraná), **Kaizo Iwakami Beltrao**, (EBAPE/FGVl), **Sheizi Calheira de Freitas** (Federal University of Bahia), **Maria Margarida Machado**, (Federal University of Goiás / Universidade Federal de Goiás), **Gilberto José Miranda**, (Universidade Federal de Uberlândia, Brazil), **Maria Lúcia Rodrigues Muller** (Universidade Federal de Mato Grosso e Science)

Almerindo Afonso Universidade do Minho Portugal

**Rosanna Maria Barros Sá** Universidade do Algarve Portugal

**Maria Helena Bonilla** Universidade Federal da Bahia Brasil

**Rosa Maria Bueno Fischer** Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul, Brasil

Alice Casimiro Lopes Universidade do Estado do Rio de Janeiro, Brasil

**Suzana Feldens Schwertner** Centro Universitário Univates Brasil

**Geovana Mendonça Lunardi Mende**s Universidade do Estado de Santa Catarina

Flávia Miller Naethe Motta Universidade Federal Rural do Rio de Janeiro, Brasil Alexandre Fernandez Vaz Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina, Brasil

**Regina Célia Linhares Hostins** Universidade do Vale do Itajaí, Brasil

Alfredo Macedo Gomes Universidade Federal de Pernambuco Brasil

**Jefferson Mainardes** Universidade Estadual de Ponta Grossa, Brasil

**Jader Janer Moreira Lopes** Universidade Federal Fluminense e Universidade Federal de Juiz de Fora, Brasil

**Debora Nunes** Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Norte, Brasil

Alda Junqueira Marin Pontifícia Universidade Católica de São Paulo, Brasil

**Dalila Andrade Oliveira** Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais, Brasil José Augusto Pacheco Universidade do Minho, Portugal

Jane Paiva Universidade do Estado do Rio de Janeiro, Brasil

Paulo Alberto Santos Vieira Universidade do Estado de Mato Grosso, Brasil

Fabiany de Cássia Tavares Silva Universidade Federal do Mato Grosso do Sul, Brasil

António Teodoro Universidade Lusófona Portugal

Lílian do Valle Universidade do Estado do Rio de Janeiro, Brasil

Alfredo Veiga-Neto Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul, Brasil

## archivos analíticos de políticas educativas consejo editorial

Editor Consultor: Gustavo E. Fischman (Arizona State University)

Coordinador (Español / Latinoamérica): **Ignacio Barrenechea, Axel Rivas** (Universidad de San Andrés Editor Coordinador (Español/Norteamérica): **Armando Alcántara Santuario** (Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México) Editor Coordinador (Español / España): **Antonio Luzon** (Universidad de Granada) Editores Asociados: **Felicitas Acosta** (Universidad Nacional de General Sarmiento), **Jason Beech** (Universidad de San Andrés), **Angelica Buendia**, (Metropolitan Autonomous University), **Alejandra Falabella** (Universidad Alberto Hurtado, Chile), **Veronica Gottau** (Universidad Torcuato Di Tella), **Carolina Guzmán-Valenzuela** (Universidad de Chile), **Cesar Lorenzo Rodriguez Urib**e (Universidad Marista de Guadalajara **María Teresa Martín Palomo** (University of Almería), **María Fernández Mellizo-Soto** (Universidad Complutense de Madrid), **Tiburcio Moreno** (Autonomous Metropolitan University-Cuajimalpa Unit), **José Luis Ramírez**, (Universidad de Sonora), **Maria Veronica Santelices** (Pontificia Universidad Católica de Chile)

**Claudio Almonacid** Universidad Metropolitana de Ciencias de la Educación, Chile

Miguel Ángel Arias Ortega Universidad Autónoma de la Ciudad de México Xavier Besalú Costa Universitat de Girona, España

Xavier Bonal Sarro Universidad Autónoma de Barcelona, España

#### Antonio Bolívar Boitia

Universidad de Granada, España

José Joaquín Brunner Universidad Diego Portales, Chile

## Damián Canales Sánchez

Instituto Nacional para la Evaluación de la Educación, México

Gabriela de la Cruz Flores Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México Marco Antonio Delgado Fuentes Universidad Iberoamericana, México

Inés Dussel, DIE-CINVESTAV, México

**Pedro Flores Crespo** Universidad Iberoamericana, México

#### Ana María García de Fanelli

Centro de Estudios de Estado y Sociedad (CEDES) CONICET, Argentina Juan Carlos González Faraco Universidad de Huelva, España

María Clemente Linuesa Universidad de Salamanca, España

Jaume Martínez Bonafé Universitat de València, España

Alejandro Márquez Jiménez Instituto de Investigaciones sobre la Universidad y la Educación, UNAM, México María Guadalupe Olivier Tellez, Universidad Pedagógica Nacional, México Miguel Pereyra Universidad de Granada, España

**Mónica Pini** Universidad Nacional de San Martín, Argentina

**Omar Orlando Pulido Chaves** Instituto para la Investigación Educativa y el Desarrollo Pedagógico (IDEP) **José Ignacio Rivas Flores** Universidad de Málaga, España Miriam Rodríguez Vargas Universidad Autónoma de Tamaulipas, México

José Gregorio Rodríguez Universidad Nacional de Colombia, Colombia Mario Rueda Beltrán Instituto de Investigaciones sobre la Universidad y la Educación, UNAM, México José Luis San Fabián Maroto Universidad de Oviedo, España

**Jurjo Torres Santomé**, Universidad de la Coruña, España

#### **Yengny Marisol Silva Laya** Universidad Iberoamericana, México

Ernesto Treviño Ronzón Universidad Veracruzana, México

Ernesto Treviño Villarreal Universidad Diego Portales Santiago, Chile Antoni Verger Planells Universidad Autónoma de Barcelona, España

Catalina Wainerman Universidad de San Andrés, Argentina Juan Carlos Yáñez Velazco Universidad de Colima, México